

ROM. *ATUNCI* AND SP. *ENTONCES*: FROM ADVERBS TO DISCOURSE MARKERS. SOME CONVERGENCES AND DIVERGENCES

CECILIA MIHAELA POPESCU*, OANA ADRIANA DUȚĂ**

ABSTRACT. *Rom. Atunci and Sp. Entonces: from Adverbs to Discourse Markers. Some Convergences and Divergences.* This study describes the semantic and functional behaviour of the Romanian adverb *atunci* and the Spanish adverb *entonces*. Our contrastive approach puts forward a common typology for the discursive values of these two lexemes which share the same etymon and shows that, across the times, they have followed a similar evolution path, from a temporal adverb to a polyfunctional discursive marker. Using examples from the CoRoLa corpus for Romanian and the CORPES corpus for Spanish, the study outlines that *atunci* and *entonces* cover a mostly similar range of discursive functions, but with different degrees of development.

Keywords: *Rom. atunci, Sp. Entonces, discourse markers, argumentative value, metatextual function, intradiscursive and interdiscursive analysis*

REZUMAT. *Rom. atunci și sp. entonces: de la adverbe la marcatori discursivi. Convergențe și divergențe.* Studiul de față descrie comportamentul semantic și funcțional al adverbului românesc *atunci* și al adverbului spaniol *entonces*. Această abordare contrastivă propune o tipologie comună pentru valorile discursive ale acestor două elemente lexicale cu etimon comun și arată că evoluția lor a fost una similară, de la adverb temporal la marcator discursiv polifuncțional. Utilizând exemple din corpusul CoRoLa pentru limba română și din corpusul CORPES pentru limba spaniolă, studiul evidențiază faptul că *atunci* și *entonces* acoperă o gamă în mare parte asemănătoare de funcții discursive, însă cu diferite grade de dezvoltare.

Cuvinte-cheie: *rom. atunci, sp. entonces, marcatori discursivi, valori argumentative, funcție metatextuală, analiză intradiscursivă și interdiscursivă*

* **Cecilia-Mihaela POPESCU** is a Professor in Romance Linguistics at the University of Craiova, Faculty of Letters. Her research activity is structured around three major topics, which are somehow complementary to each other and which relate to: a) studying the semantic-functional behavior of certain verbal compartments (future, subjunctive, conditional, presumptive) in Romance languages viewed in synchronicity, diachrony, but also in contrast, b) analyzing lexical borrowings from French to Romanian, and c) studying discursive markers in Romance languages. E-mail: cecilia99_ro@yahoo.com.

** **Oana-Adriana DUȚĂ** is a Senior Lecturer in Spanish Linguistics and Translation Studies at the University of Craiova. She has authored two handbooks of linguistics and numerous articles in international and national academic journals. She has performed extensive research on foreign languages teaching in several international projects focused on education and her research focuses on cognitive semantics, contrastive phraseology and translation studies. E-mail: oana.duta@yahoo.com.

1. Introduction

This study aims at providing a brief description of the semantic and functional behaviour of the Romanian adverb *atunci* and the Spanish adverb *entonces*, two lexical items sharing a significant range of discursive values. The main purpose is to establish whether the original Latin structure – **ad/in-tunc-ce* – underwent an identical evolution – from a temporal adverb to a polyfunctional discursive marker – in two Romance languages, located at the opposite ends of Romània. A secondary objective is to verify the analysis scheme we have already proposed in previous studies (see Popescu 2014, 2019; Iliescu/Costăchescu/Popescu 2018) and illustrate it with the help of a comprehensive corpus of contemporary Romanian, CoRoLa and the Spanish corpus CORPES. This contrastive approach proposes a common typology for two lexical items which, though sharing the same etymon, have not been subjected to a parallel analysis so far. However, it must be mentioned that Rom. *Atunci* has been investigated, both individually (see Zafiu 2009) and in comparison to Fr. *Alors* by Popescu (2012, 2014, 2018, 2019), while Sp. *entonces* has been compared to Fr. *Alors*, by Bazzanella / Bosco / Garcea / Gili Fivela / Miecznikowski and Tini Brunozzi (2007) or to It. *Allora* by Bazzanella and Borreguero Zuloaga (2011).

Regarding the nature of the presented occurrences, they have been excerpted, for both involved linguistic systems, from recent up-to-date corpora that include press texts emulating spoken language. For Romanian, this is the CoRoLa corpus, which became operational in 2018 and provides an image of written and spoken for contemporary Romanian language. The search for *atunci* in CoRoLa resulted in a number of 152,568 matches. The occurrences of *entonces* have been extracted from a list of 48,700 hits provided by *El Corpus del Español del Siglo XXI* (CORPES), updated as of December 2018, selecting only texts published in Spain (not Latin America).

As for the structure of our investigation, besides the introduction, the paper includes two major sections, one for each analysed word. For a clearer image of the semantic and functional behaviour of each item, as well as possible additional valences, we have preferred to describe them distinctly at first and to outline a range of similarities and differences between *atunci* and *entonces* in the final part of the paper (concluding remarks).

2. The Semantic and Functional Behaviour of Rom. *atunci* and Sp. *Entonces*

2.1. *Atunci*

In Romanian, *atunci* (proceeding from the Latin compound locution **AD-TUNC-CE* (see RDW 1986-1989; DLR 1958-2009; DEX 1998; for **AD/IN+TUNC*

see also Chircu 2008: 36, 45, 56, 195), appears with an anaphoric temporal value from its very first attestations in written texts of the 16th century¹, indicating the following types of chronological relations: (1) total simultaneity of two predications (see 1 below); (ii) the succession of predications in a narrative sequence (see 2 below); (iii) anteriority compared to a certain point of reference (see 3 below); (iv) posteriority (4 below) or partial simultaneity between two predications (as in 5 and 6) (also see Popescu 2014, 2019)².

- (1) *...m-am trezit, deodată, parte integrantă din tabloul „Turnul Babel” al marelui pictor israelian, originar din România, Baruch Elron [...]. Am avut **atunci** bucuria și mândria-[...] –să-l văd în fruntea tuturor, recunoscut astfel la valoarea sa reală integral, cu onestitate, cu respect și admirație. (Corola-blog/BlogPost/367642_a_368971).*
 ‘... I suddenly discovered I was a part of the painting “The Babel Tower”, by the great Romanian-origin Israeli painter Baruch Elron [...]. I was **then** happy and proud – [...] – to see him leading the others, recognized at his genuine value, in an integral, honest, respectful and admiring manner.’
- (2) *Când sabia din nișă a fost scoasă, Este trezit balaurul adormit, Și bestia se avântă furioasă Spre Siegfried care la luptă a pornit. Balauru-i ucis de viteazul prinț, Ce apoi în sângele lui se scaldă, Dar din tei o frunză **atunci** s-a desprins// Și pe umărul său avea să cadă. (Corola-blog/BlogPost/382075_a_383404).*
 ‘When the sword was taken out, The asleep dragon was wakened, And the beast furiously leapt Towards Siegfried who started the battle, The dragon was killed by the brave prince, Who then in his blood bathed, But **then** a leaf fell from the linden tree // And it would fall on his shoulder.’
- (3) *Când omul, o simplă componentă a materiei, a început să se creadă parte dumnezeiască, **atunci** practic a început decăderea lui și a spațiului unde fusese trimis de puterea universală a iubirii. (Corola-blog/BlogPost/380101_a_381430)*
 ‘When man, a simple component of matter, started to believe he was a part of God, it was practically **then** when he started to decay, along with the space he had been sent to by the universal power of love.’
- (4) *A doua întâlnire a coincis cu deplasarea mea în India. Am recitit cartea și **abia atunci** am înțeles că este mai mult decât o frumoasă poveste de dragoste ce a marcat generații întregi³. (Corola-blog/BlogPost/97107_a_98399)*

¹ The lexeme first appears in *Codicele Voronețean* (the edition by Mariana Costinescu): *vremile de-atuncea* (see RDW1986-1989, s. v. *atunci*).

² The translations into English belong to the authors of this article.

³ For a clearer definition of the temporal framework of reference, *atunci* is frequently accompanied by certain prepositions such as *de* (*de atunci* ‘since then’), *pe* (*pe atunci* ‘back then’) or *până* (*până atunci* ‘until then’). For instance, in the following sentence, the phrase *pe atunci* reinforces the value of the indicative imperfect past tense, expressing a vague, undetermined temporal location: *Era o*

‘The second meeting coincided with my travel to India. I re-read the book and it was **only then** when I understood that it was more than a beautiful love story that impressed generation after generation.’

- (5) *Treaba asta a fost urmărită de o veveriță care **tocmai atunci** se-ntorsesese în pomul cel vechi și găunos, unde găsi un loc nemaipomenit de bun să-și amenajeze o scorbură. Chiar găsi un măr mic și stafidit, rămas în pom până-n primăvară ca prin minune, iar acum îl ducea harnic* (Corola-blog/BlogPost/341882_a_343211).

‘This was seen by a squirrel who **just then** had returned to the old shallow tree, where it found a perfect place to arrange a burrow. It even managed to found a small, dried apple, which had miraculously stayed in the tree until spring, and it now carried it dutifully.’

- (6) *dar tu ești tot inocentă // habar nu ai ce gropi or să facă **atunci când** vor cădea balabuștele alea de avioane de care noi nici măcar nu avem nevoie* (Corola-blog/BlogPost/364195_a_365524).

‘but you’re still innocent // you have no idea the holes that will appear **when** those giant airplanes fall down, that we don’t even need’

In such occurrences, *atunci* is compulsory not only for the grammaticality of the sentence, which would certainly be correct even if such item were not used, but especially for the communicative level, which might be affected if *atunci* were discarded (and the logical-temporal order would then be implicitly marked).

On this sentence level, *atunci* has a special type of use. It is inserted in digressive structures, such as the one seen below in (7):

- (7) *Apoi s-a obiectivat în Fundația Tempus România în Traian-Ialomîța, în Căminul cultural din (satul-**pe atunci**, acum comună) Traian, ca primă etapă a punerii în acțiune a unui vis.* (Corola-blog/BlogPost/370583_a_371912).

‘Afterwards, it turned into the Tempus Romania Foundation of Traian – Ialomita, in the Cultural Centre of Traian (**then** a village, now a commune), as a first step of the enactment of a dream.’

In such cases, *atunci* maintains its anaphoric temporal value, but also acquires a slight pragmatic value, helping to introduce an additional marking of the speaker’s belief universe and thus suggesting a subjective modalisation of the sentence.

*seară rece, noroasa, please în acea zi de iarnă iar nori cenușii amenințau cu încă o bună ploaie pe noapte. Lucram **pe atunci** ca paznic pe șantierele din Valencia ...* ‘It was a cold, cloudy evening, it had rained on that winter day, and the grey clouds announced another major rain during the night. I **then** worked as a guard on the worksites in Valencia...’ (Corola-blog/BlogPost/353073_a_354402).

At the same time, this latter anaphoric value (cf. 5 and 6), rendered in relation to a benchmark placed in the past or in the future⁴ – will result in the development of another function of the analysed lexical unit, i.e. *anaphoric (temporal) connector*, which is seen on an intradiscursive level, in two types of discursive matrices, as follows:

(a) on the one hand, *atunci* is the *correlative element of a conditional phrase* in structures of the type [if p, q], where it acquires a (strong) *logical and argumentative value*, as a *genuine focalising discursive marker*, as in (8) and (9):

(8) *Un celebru citat al lui George Bernard Shaw spune: „Dacă tu ai un măr și eu am un măr și facem schimb de mere, atunci tu și eu vom avea în continuare un măr. Dar dacă tu ai o idee și eu am o idee și le schimbăm, atunci fiecare dintre noi va avea două idei!” Această carte este o ilustrare a acestui citat. Comunicarea. (Corola-blog/BlogPost/380091_a_381420)*

‘A famous quote by George Bernard Shaw goes like this: “If you have an apple and I have an apple and we exchange apples, **then** you and I will still have an apple. But if you have an idea and I have an idea and we exchange them, **then** each of us will have two ideas!” This book is an illustration of this quote. Communication.’

(9) A: - *Bun rachieu; prună curată, a-ntâia!*

B: - *Păi, n-are coana primăriță marfă bună?*

A: - *Are, dacă ea n-o avea, atunci cine să mai aibă?* (Corola-blog/BlogPost/366909_a_368238).

‘A: - Great brandy; great plums, first quality!

B: - The mayor definitely has good products!

A: - She does, if she hasn’t, who else would **then** have?’

(b) on the other hand, this lexical unit frequently appears to correct two main clauses – frequently referring to the sphere of the past with a *cumulated logical and temporal value*; actually, we are dealing with a transposition of succession from the temporal to the factual and argumentative sphere (see Zafiu 2009: 784), as it can be seen under (10) and (11):

(10) *[...] a văzut că acesta începe să se miște, să se rostogolească, să se târască și în cele din urmă s-a transformat într-un șarpe și atunci l-a apucat frica văzând cele întâmplate* (Corola-blog/BlogPost/363293_a_364622).

‘[...] he saw that it began to move, to roll, to crawl and eventually turned into a snake and **then** he got scared seeing what had happened’

(11) *Ideea de bază e că această fobie în general e cauzată de un set de limitări care [SIC!] le proiectăm în mintea noastră ca lucruri care ne vor pune într-o*

⁴ In such cases, *atunci* is accompanied by the adverbial antecedent *când* ‘when’ and/or by the adverb *tocmai (când)* ‘exactly (when)’.

poziție de a ne umili în public. Este critic atunci să încetăm să căutăm soluții rapide și simple și să ne concentrăm pe a înțelege care sunt acele limitări pentru noi [...]. (Corola-blog/BlogPost/338700_a_340029)

'The basic idea is that this phobia is generally caused by a range of limitations that are projected to our mind as things that will place us in a publicly humiliating position. It is **then** critical to stop looking for quick and simple solutions and focus on understanding which are those limitations for us [...].'

Eventually, starting from this type of *argumentative* and *logical-temporal functioning*, the analysed lexeme developed a range of values that are seen both on a *cognitive*⁵, and on an *interactional level*. This range of values is seen both on the *intradiscursive level* (see 12-16), and especially on the *cross-discursive level* (see 17-20), where *atunci* connects two communication situations or two speech acts. Thus, on a *cross-discursive level*, *atunci* frequently acts as a delimiter, signalling the articulation of various parts of the discourse. For instance, in (13, 14 and 15) *atunci* marks the conclusion of an entire argumentative complex. However, in all these examples, the metadiscursive function is also accompanied by other secondary values (reproach in (13); satisfaction in (14); the demand for a response from the speaker in (15)), detectable depending on the communication context (intonation, pauses, position, etc.).

(12) *Te iubesc, iar dacă satul acesta nu-ți place, ei bine, atunci o să plecăm împreună... împreună, legați ca spicele în snop, ca luna și râul...* (Corola-publishing house/Science/977_a_2485)[+indignation, discontent and partial agreement of the speaker who wants to obtain a response from the other speaker; however, we can notice an into national pause between *ei bine* and *atunci*, graphically marked with a comma].

'I love you and if you don't like this village, *well*, **then** we'll leave together... together, tied together like ears of wheat with a twine, like the moon and the river...'

(13) *Drept pentru care - după cum mi-a mărturisit - dacă în urma citirii primelor pagini nu simte nimic, ei bine atunci renunță pur și simplu la lectură și trece la următoarea.* Corola-blog/BlogPost/375306_a_376635 [no intonational pause between *ei bine* and the analysed item, *atunci*]

'Which is why - as he confessed - if he doesn't feel anything after reading the first pages, *well then* he'll just give up [the book] and will move to the next one'

⁵ For instance, in the epistemic area, this item subjectively alters the sentence, underlining the idea of doubt or the speaker's trust in the propositional content previously asserted by the other speaker. At the same time, in terms of discursive structuring, *atunci* frequently marks the conclusion of an entire argumentative complex or the articulation of various parts of the discourse.

- (14) *Este al nostru, și-ar fi trebuit să învățăm până acum că vine o vreme în viața fiecăruia dintre noi când începe numărătoarea inversă, și-atunci să vedem pe unde ne scoatem cămașă!* (Corola-blog/BlogPost/347885_a_349214) [+ metadiscursive function, + satisfaction].
 ‘It is ours and we should have learned by now that there is a time in the life of everyone when the countdown begins *and then* we shall see how we sort it out!’
- (15) *Prin urmare, așa vasăzică, domnule,-își spunea Augusto despărțindu-se de portăreasă -, iată ce obligații mi-am creat față de femeia asta. Căci acum nu se mai cuvine să las lucrurile baltă. Ce-ar zice atunci despre mine acest model al portăreselor? Așadar...* (Corola-publishing house/Imaginative/1900_a_3225)[+delimiter, +demand for a response from the recipient, in our case the speaker himself].
 ‘Therefore, look what happens, man – Augusto was saying to himself as he left the porter – look at the obligations I now have to this woman. Now I just cannot give up. What would *then* think of me this model of porters? So...’
- (16) *Nici de pe dealuri nu lipsesc florile, nici pomii de salcâmi și de liliac, care își combină mirosurile cu cel al florilor și atunci ai impresia că te afli într-un colț de rai, în natură.* (Corola-blog/BlogPost/347846_a_349175).
 ‘The flowers and the acacias and lilac shrubs are also found on the hills. They combine their smells with those of flowers *and then* one has the impression of being in a corner of heaven, in nature.’

As a *pragmatic and discursive marker*, the analysed lexeme has two major types of functions: an *interactive function* or a *metadiscursive function*. In the first case, *atunci* frequently appears in formulae ending a conversation expressing the *agreement* of participants in a dialogue (see 17a) or, often, a *demand for a confirmation* or simply *for a reaction from the speaker*. In a phone or radio conversation, *atunci* acts similarly to the occurrence in (17a), having the value of *control of the quality of the reception of the sentence by the recipient*. In other cases, the analysed item *indicates a new topic* (17b, 18) or a *new phase of activity*. In some other discursive situations, *atunci* functions as a *floor-holding signal*, as a *device for maintaining speech*, as a *device to give the floor to someone else* or to *engage the other speaker in the conversation* (as in 19).

- (17a) A: *Te-oi ajuta, Mărine! Dar un pot luni că m-am promis înaltă parte.*
 B: - *Păi rămâne atunci de marți. Mai trec luni seara pe la tine să-ți mai aduc aminte?* (Corola-blog/BlogPost/369482_a_370811)
 ‘A: - I’ll help you, Marin! But I can’t do it on Monday, because I promised to be somewhere else.
 B: - *Well, then*, starting Tuesday. Shall I drop by your place on Monday night to remind you?’ [+conclusion]

- (17b) A: - *Mulțumesc papa, dar nu am pe ce să-i cheltui. Totul aici este plătit după cum s-ar zice.*
 B: - *Da, bine **atunci**, să mai dai câte un telefon când te lasă fata în pace, încheie tatăl său cu subînțeleș.*
 A: - *La revedere papa, vă voi sună zilnic!* (Corola-blog/BlogPost/341985_a_343314)
 'A: - Thank you, papa, but I don't have where to spend it. Everything is paid here as they say.
 B: - Yeah, *well then*, give us a call when the girl leaves you alone, the father ended with substance.
 A: - Bye, papa, I'll *call* you every day!'
- (18) A: - *Sigur ne vom întoarce?*
 B: - *Sigur, stăpână, cum să nu?*
 A: - *Bine **atunci**, **hai** să plecăm.* (Corola-blog/BlogPost/367871_a_369200)
 'A: - We'll definitely be back?
 B: - Sure, madam, definitely!
 A: - Well *then, let's* go.'
- (19) *Ei vor obosi din ce în ce mai tare. Calitatea actului medical va scădea. Și eventual, își vor băga și ei picioarele. Ce veți face **atunci**?* (Corola-website/Journalistic/101879_a_103171).
 'They'll get more and more tired. The quality of the medical act will decrease. And, eventually, they won't give a damn any more. What will you do *then*?'

As a *delimiter*, *atunci* (frequently accompanied by *și*) pursues and develops the conversational interventions resulting from an experience, from a shared way of thinking, and, thus, ensures discursive cohesion. Such functioning is frequently characteristic for the intradiscursive level and is quite rarely seen in dialogues such as the following:

- (20) A: - *Acum suntem aici!*
 B: - ***Atunci** nu suntem tot ... aici, ca vârcolaci?*
 A: - *Da! Dar ...nu vezi că suntem în casă?*
 B: - *Ce casă, bă Costică! E cavou!*
 A: - *Cum cavou!? Nu vezi masa? Nu vezi sticla de vin și paharele pline?*
 B: - *Păi ... **și atunci** vom avea toate acestea ... în imaginație. Ca și acum!*
 A: - *Nu! **Atunci** ieșim din mormânt și ... ne ducem la cârciumă pentru a bea.* (Corola-blog/BlogPost/346846_a_348175)
 'A: - We are here now!
 B: - *Then* aren't we still... here, as zombies?
 A: - Yes! But... can't you see we are in the house?
 B: - What house are you seeing, Costica? This is a tomb!
 A: - It's not a tomb! Can't you see the table? And the bottle of wine and the full glasses?

B: - Well... **and then** we'll have all these... in our imagination. Like now!

A: - No! **Then** we'll come out of the tomb and... we'll go to the bar to drink.'

All these pragmatic discursive values of *atunci*, detected on a cross- and intradiscursive level, may be doubled by a wide range of *affective* and *attitudinal nuances* (such as the expression of *reproach, indignation, satisfaction, surprise, etc.*).

As for the position of this discursive marker in the sentence, it can be placed at the beginning, at the middle or at the end. However, it is seen that *atunci* is most likely placed in initial position (rarely, final position), especially on an intradiscursive level.

While in sentences with temporal value *atunci* is mostly compulsory in order to provide an explicitation of the temporal order, it can be discarded in the structures where it has an argumentative or pragmatic value, and the grammaticality or the global meaning of the sentence is not affected.

2.2. *Entonces*

According to the *Breve diccionario etimológico de la lengua castellana* by Joan Coromines, *entonces* appeared in the Spanish language around 1250 – with a prior form, *estonces* (from Lat. IN TUNC), being attested in 1140. The form *estonce* is also seen in *El Cantar de Mio Cid*, written around 1200, with the temporal value it has maintained to our days:

Estonce mandó dar el Cid a los mandaderos de los infantes de Navarra e de Aragón bestias e todo lo ál que menester ovieron, e embiólos. (cf. Fernández-Ordóñez 2008: 19).

As previously said, the occurrences of *entonces* discussed in the following have been extracted from a list of 346 hits provided by El Corpus del Español del Siglo XXI (CORPES) after applying the following selection parameters: origin – Spain (to ensure consistency of the examples and discard any additional regional uses of the term), medium – written, block – non-fiction, source – press, year – 2015.

As outlined by Spanish grammars such as Gili Gaya (1993), Alcina Franch & Blecua (1994), Alarcos Llorach (1994), Gómez Torrego (1997) and Bosque & Demonte (2003), *entonces* primarily has a temporal value, working as a deictic pronominal adverb, and indicates simultaneity of two predicates, with a temporal anaphoric value and maintaining the time of reference established in the previous sentence⁶ – as in (21)-(27) below, posteriority with close-to-simultaneous

⁶ The observation regarding the temporal deictic frame of *atunci* is perfectly valid for *entonces* as well: in its anaphoric temporal classification it often appears accompanied by certain prepositions or prepositional phrases, such as *por, hasta, de, a partir de*, or even by a preposition followed by a noun phrase or an equivalent structure (Pavón Lucero 2003: 615), such as *poraquel, por ese, enaquel, en ese*.

temporal placement – (28), or anteriority in relation to a point of reference – (29) below. It is worth mentioning that the deictic Sp. *Entonces* can function as a predicative in what Fernández Leborans refers to as “oración copulativa a identificativa inversa” (2003: 2382) or “specificational sentence”, i.e. a sentence whose semantic function is that of specifying a value for a variable, as in (24) and (25), or as a noun complement, referring to offices or positions held at a specific moment in time, as in (26) and (27) below.

- (21) *Tras una convalecencia agónica, recibió el alta a final de mes y se declaró “feliz por estar viva”. Los médicos aseguraron **entonces** que ya no era una paciente infecciosa.*
 ‘After an agonic convalescence, she was discharged from the hospital at the end of the month and stated she was “happy to be alive”. The doctors **then** guaranteed that she no longer was an infectious patient.’
- (22) *Lo que importaba **entonces** no era el comportamiento, la superficie, lo que importaban eran los procesos.*
 ‘What mattered **then** / **at that time** was not the behaviour, the surface; what mattered were the processes.’
- (23) *Y también recoge la procedencia de los fondos de la sociedad, en su inmensa mayoría provenientes del PP regional, dirigido **entonces** por el expresidente de la Generalitat Francisco Camps.*
 ‘And it also shows the source of the society’s funds, mostly from the regional PP, **then** managed by the former president of the Generalitat, Francisco Camps.’
- (24) *En cuanto a trama, está claro que las historias de Walt y Thao se unen a partir del intento de robo, pues es **entonces** cuando Thao empieza a trabajar para Walt y cuando se empieza a crear un vínculo entre ellos. [+exact simultaneity, fully simultaneous occurrence of concurrent events].*
 ‘As for the narrative, it is clear that the histories of Walt and Thao come together beginning with the theft attempt, as it is **then** when Thao starts working for Walt and when a connection between them starts to develop.’
- (26) *Fue precisamente **entonces** cuando Harry Mills fue llamado a filas para incorporarse al servicio de comunicaciones.*
 ‘It was precisely **then** when Harry Mills was called to join the communications service.’
- (27) *Las escuchas telefónicas a las que habría sido sometido el **entonces** director del FMI se realizaron entre junio de 2010 y febrero de 2011, meses antes de iniciarse la investigación oficial por el llamado caso Carlton de Lille que ahora juzga un tribunal. [+position held at a specific moment, which is no longer valid].*

‘The phone hearings to which the **then** director of the IMF would be subject took place from June 2010 to February 2011, several months before the beginning of the official investigation for the so-called case of Carlton de Lille that is now judged in court.’

- (28) *Cuando en 2002 el republicano Bush pidió poderes de guerra al Congreso, decenas de demócratas votaron a favor. Entre ellos, la **entonces** senadora Hillary Clinton.*

‘When the republican Bush asked the Congress to grant him powers of war, dozens of democrats voted in favour. The **then** senator Hillary Clinton was one of them.’

- (29) *Lo suyo es esperar, no medicarle, ver si las fases psicóticas se repiten a menudo y si las mismas le van deteriorando. Y **entonces** sí se podrá decir que se trata de una esquizofrenia, algo que en realidad acaece en poquísimos casos.*

‘You should wait, not provide medication, and see whether the psychotic phases repeat often and affect him. And [only] **then** you may establish whether you are dealing with schizophrenia, which actually happens in very few cases.’

- (30) *El hospital de Toulouse ha remitido también a un estudio publicado en la India el pasado marzo. **Entonces** se llevó a cabo el mismo procedimiento. Ocho pacientes que fueron trasplantadas recibieron el injerto por vía vaginal mediante laparoscopia.*

‘The hospital of Toulouse also referred to a study published in India last year, in March. The same procedure was undertaken **then**. Eight patients who got a transplant were intra-vaginally injected via laparoscopy.’

Entonces also acquires an argumentative / epistemic pragmatic value – in the apodosis of a conditional sentence – usually marking the speaker’s intention of making sure that the recipient remembers the hypothetical framework that must be considered for a proper interpretation of the consequent clause or the implicit/explicit existence of a condition-consequence relationship between the propositional contents of the protasis and the apodosis (Montolío 2003: 3714), as in (31) and (32) below.

- (31) *Si los elefantes pueden ser la clave para resolver algunos de los misterios del cáncer, **entonces** va a haber una mayor conciencia sobre la difícil situación de estos animales en todo el mundo.*

‘If elephants can be the key to solve some mysteries of cancer, **then** people will be more aware of the difficult situation of these animals all over the world.’

- (32) *Si el mundo imaginario es tan bello a través de la naturaleza real, **entonces** el encuentro con lo inexplicable solo se puede producir bajo el cielo cristalino reflejado al borde de las montañas más altas de la Tierra.*
 ‘If the imaginary world is so beautiful through real nature, **then** the encounter with the unexplainable can only happen under the crystalline sky reflecting on the slopes of the highest mountains on earth.’

As a discursive marker, *entonces* acquires a metatextual function, in the form of a conclusion of a previous argument or, as Eguren (2003: 963) puts it, a “connector with a resultative value”. In (33)-(35) below, *entonces* introduces a conclusion and ensures the continuity of the discourse. Furthermore, the other values of *entonces* are not completely erased when it works as a conclusive connector: in (36) it refers to a real situation, though not explicitly marked, with an epistemic consecutive valence, while in (37) and (38) it underpins the coherent continuity of the narrative, but the [+posteriority]temporal value is still present to some extent:

- (33) A. - *Explíqueme cuáles son **entonces** los beneficios de la cerveza.*
 B. - *Contiene dos productos muy beneficiosos para la salud (...).*
 A. - *¿**Entonces** recomienda tomar una o dos cañas diarias?*
 B. - *Por supuesto, porque aporta muchos beneficios para la salud.*
 [+engagement of the speaker, elicitation of a response].
 ‘A. - Explain to me which are **then** the benefits of beer.
 B. - It includes two ingredients which are very beneficial for health (...).
 A. - Do you **then** recommend one or two pints a day?
 B. - Of course, because it’s very good for your health.’
- (34) ***Entonces**, ¿quién debe hacerse un test genético? Balmaña explica que hay casos en los que está muy definido.*
 ‘**Then**, who should take a genetic test? Balmaña explains that this is very clear in some cases.’
- (35) *Es natural **entonces** considerar qué tendencia del húmedo induce una tendencia del seco cuando la humedad se mantiene constante.*
 ‘It is **then** natural to consider what tendency of wet temperature induces a tendency of dry temperature when humidity is constant.’
- (36) *Como auditora, **entonces** sabrá que las cuentas de Monedero no están muy claras.* [+consequence].
 ‘Since you are an auditor, **then** you’ll know that the accounts of the financial service are not very clear.’
- (37) *Dentro de 10 años no conservaremos los correos electrónicos sobre determinados sucesos. ¿Cómo contaremos **entonces** nuestra historia?*
 [+conclusion] [+cataphoric reference, at that future point in time].

‘Ten years from now, we’ll no longer keep e-mails regarding certain events. How will we **then** tell our story?’

- (38) *En los servicios de urgencias psiquiátricas nunca hay suficiente tiempo para que el maniacodepresivo explore en su historia, podemos comprender su problema y entonces tratarlo.*

‘In psychiatric emergency services there is never enough time for a maniac depressive to be able to explore his history, so that we can understand his issue and **then / thus** treat him.’

3. Final considerations

The etymologically related Romanian adverb *atunci* and the Spanish adverb *entonces* cover a mostly similar range of discursive functions, but with different degrees of development. On the one hand, in contemporary Romanian, the original temporal meaning of the adverb *atunci* has not been lost, but, especially in the oral/spoken register, this is no longer central. *Atunci* is frequently used in argumentative structures expressing result, consequence or conclusion, thus belonging to the class of *consecutive connectors*, along with *deci* ‘so’ *astfel* ‘thus’, *de asemenea* ‘likewise’, etc., and, mainly at an intradiscursive level, it has acquired a wide range of additional significations. On the other hand, *entonces* presents a more extensive and varied range of temporal values. It is mostly used with the meaning of “that moment in the past” (also within noun phrases) and its temporal meaning is also maintained to some degree when it fulfils epistemic and metatextual functions. Hence, although our study did not have a statistical purpose (and a frequency analysis could fall within the scope of a different investigation), it can be observed that, *atunci* is more frequently used as a discursive marker, while *entonces* has a stronger deictic focalization. Our hypothesis is that the lower number of cases where *entonces* is used as a discursive marker is due to the fact that the meaning of consequence is covered by a quite wide range of lexical items in Spanish, such as *luego*, *pues*, *conque*, etc.

From a cross-linguistic perspective, it can be noticed that, except for example (6) – where *atunci* supports the meaning of the conjunction *când* – all the examples from the Romanian corpus can be translated into Spanish using a structure that includes *entonces*. Conversely, except for example (38) – where the meaning of posteriority is so powerful that the use of *apoi/după aceea* is compulsory in the translation – all the examples from the Spanish corpus can be translated into Romanian using a structure including *atunci*.

Our approach proves that the same etymon undergoes a similar evolution in related languages, from a temporal adverb to a genuine discursive marker that expresses various discursive relations such as conclusion, consequence, communication link in spontaneous speech, appearing both at an intradiscursive and cross-discursive level.

The analytical approach presented in this study, based on a diverse corpus, emphasizes the need to enrich the lexicographic description of the analysed lexemes, as many discursive meanings are not included in most explanatory dictionaries, both monolingual or bilingual.

SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY

a) *Theoretical works:*

- Alarcos Llorach, Emilio, *Gramática de la lengua española*, Madrid, Espasa Calpe, 1994.
- Alcina Franch, Juan, Blecua, José Manuel, *Gramática española*, Barcelona, Ariel, 1994.
- Bazzanella, Carla / Borreguero Zuloaga, Margarita, *Allora e entonces: problemi teorici e dati empirici*, in Khachaturyan, E. (ed.), *Discourse Markers in Romance languages, Oslo Studies in Language* 3(1), 2011, p. 7-45, <http://www.journals.uio.no/osla> (consultat în 15. 11. 2019).
- Bazzanella, Carla / Bosco, Cristina / Garcea, Alessandro / Gili Fivela, Barbara / Miecznikowski, Johanna / Tini Brunozzi, Francesca, *Italian allora, French alors: Functions, convergences and divergences, Catalan Journal of Linguistics* 6, 2007, p. 9-30.
- Bazzanella, Carla, *I segnali discorsivi*, in Renzi, L., Salvi G., Cardinaletti A. (eds.), *Grande grammatica italiana di consultazione*, vol. III, Bologna, Il Mulino, 1995, p. 225-257.
- Bosque, Ignacio / Demonte Violeta (coord.), *Gramática descriptiva de la lengua española*, Madrid, Espasa Calpe, 2003.
- Chircu, Adrian, *L'adverbe dans les langues romanes. Études étymologique, lexicale et morphologique* (français, roumain, italien, espagnol, portugais, catalan, provençal), Cluj-Napoca, Casa Cărții de Știință, 2008.
- ***, *Codicele Voronețean*. Ediție critică, studiu filologic și studiu lingvistic de Mariana Costinescu, București, Editura Minerva, 1981.
- Closs-Traugott, Elizabeth / Dasher, Richard, *Regularity in Semantic Change*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, vol. 97.2002.
- Dostie, Gaétane, *Pragmaticalisation et marqueurs discursifs*, 2004, Paris, Éditions De Boeck Supérieur.
- Eguren, Luis, *Pronombres y adverbios demostrativos. Las relaciones deícticas*, in Bosque, Ignacio, Demonte Violeta (coord.), *Gramática descriptiva de la lengua española*, Madrid, Espasa Calpe, p. 929-972.
- Fernández Leborans, M^a Jesús, *La predicación: las oraciones copulativas*, in Bosque, Ignacio, Demonte Violeta (coord.), *Gramática descriptiva de la lengua española*, Madrid, Espasa Calpe, p. 2357-2460.
- Fernández-Ordóñez, Inés, *El Mio Cid a través de las crónicas medievales*, in Jesús Gómez, *Ochocientos años de "Mio Cid": Una visión interdisciplinar*, Madrid, Ministerio de Educación, <http://www.uam.es/FyL/documento/1446774253232/2008_El%20Mio%20Cid%20a%20traves%20de%20las%20cr%C3%B3nicas%20medievales.pdf> (consultat în 27. 11. 2019)

- Gerecht Marie-Jeanne, *Alors: opérateur temporel, connecteur argumentatif et marqueurs de discours*, in *Cahiers de linguistique française* 8, 1987, p. 69-79.
- Ghezzi, Chiara / Molinelli, Piera (eds.), *Discourse and Pragmatic Markers from Latin to the Romance Languages*, 2014, New York, Oxford University Press.
- Gili Gaya, Samuel, *Curso superior de sintaxis española*, Barcelona, Bibliograf, 1993.
- Gómez, Torrego, Leonardo, *Gramática didáctica del español*, Madrid, SM, 1997.
- Hybertie Ch., *La conséquence en français*, 1996, Paris, Éditions Ophrys.
- Iliescu, Maria / Costăchescu, Adriana / Popescu, Cecilia-Mihaela, *Pragmatique et lexicologie: (angl.) then et ses correspondants romans (fr. alors, it. allora, esp. entonces, roum. atunci)*, in Roberto Antonelli / Glessgen, Martin and Paul Videsott (eds.), *Atti del XXVIII Congresso internazionale di linguistica e filologia romanza* (Roma, Università La Sapienza, 18-23 July 2016), vol. 1, Bibliothèque de Linguistique Romane 15,1, SLR-EiPHi, Éditions de Linguistique et de Philologie, Strasbourg, 2018, p. 333-344.
- Ionescu, Alice / Popescu, Cecilia Mihaela, *Les marqueurs de changement de topique du discours en roumain : évolution sémantique et rôles pragmatiques*, in *Discours, Revue de linguistique, psycholinguistique et informatique/A journal of linguistics, psycholinguistics and computational linguistics*, 23/2018 (December 2018), <https://journals.openedition.org/discours/9343>.
- Jucker, Andreas H. / Irma Taavitsainen (eds.), *Historical Pragmatics*, Berlin / New York, Mouton de Gruyter, 2010.
- Kovacci, Ofelia, *El adverbio*, in Bosque, Ignacio, Demonte Violeta (coord.), *Gramática descriptiva de la lengua española*, Madrid, Espasa Calpe, 2003, p. 705-786.
- Martín Cid, Manuel, *Sintaxis funcional básica del español: estratos, propiedades y operaciones*, Sevilla, Universidad de Sevilla, 1998.
- Montolío, Estrella, *Las construcciones condicionales*, in Bosque, Ignacio, Demonte Violeta (coord.), *Gramática descriptiva de la lengua española*, Madrid, Espasa Calpe, p. 3643-3737.
- Mosegaard Hansen Maj-Britt, *Alors and donc in spoken French: A reanalysis*, in *Journal of Pragmatics* 28, 1997, p. 153-187.
- Pavón Lucero, M^a Victoria, *Clases de partículas: preposición, conjunción y adverbio*, in Bosque, Ignacio, Demonte Violeta (coord.), *Gramática descriptiva de la lengua española*, Madrid, Espasa Calpe, p. 565-655.
- Popescu, Mihaela, *Marqueurs discursifs dans les langues romanes: convergences et divergences fonctionnelles (fr. alors / roum. atunci)*, in Óscar Loureda, Sellán, Guillermo Álvarez, Rudka, Martha (eds.), *Marcadores del discurso y lingüística contrastiva en las lenguas románicas*, Frankfurt, Iberoamericana Vervuert, 2019.
- Popescu, Mihaela, *Romanian atunci and French alors: functional and discourse properties*, in Ghezzi, Chiara, Molinelli, Piera (eds.), *Discourse and Pragmatic Markers from Latin to the Romance Languages*, New York, Oxford University Press, 2014, p. 222-236.
- Popescu, Mihaela, *La pragmatization de deux adverbes : roum. atunci vs. fr. alors*, in *Annales de l'Université de Craïova. Seria Științe Filologice, Langues et littératures romanes*, XVI, 1, 2012, p. 152-168.
- Schiffrin, Deborah, *Discourse markers*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 1987.

- Ștefănescu Ariadna, *Pragmatic aspects. Insights on contemporary Romanian*, Bucharest, Editura Universității din București, 2007a (*Aspecte pragmatice. Incursiuni în limba română actuală*).
- Ștefănescu Ariadna, *Pragmatic connectors*, Bucharest, Editura Universității din București, 2007b (*Conectori pragmatice*).
- Traugott, Elisabeth Closs, *The role of the development of discourse markers in a theory of grammaticalization*. Paper presented at ICEHL XII, 1995, Manchester, <<http://www.stanford.edu/~traugott/papers/discourse.pdf>>.
- Zafiu Rodica, *The evolution of the time adverbs atunci, acum, apoi to the status of discursive markers*, în Rodica Zafiu, Stoica, Gabriela, Constantinescu, Mihaela N. (eds.), *Limba română. Teme actuale. Actele celui de - al 8 - lea Colocviu al Catedrei de limba română*, Bucharest, Editura Universității din București, 2009, p. 779-793 (*Evoluția adverbilor de timp atunci, acum, apoi către statutul de mărci discursive*).
- Zafiu, Rodica, *Some observations on pragmatic connectors in Romanian*, în *SCL*, 40, 3, 1989, p. 315-319 (*Câteva observații asupra conectorilor pragmatice din limba română*).

b) Corpus:

- CDER = Ciorănescu, Alexandru, *Etymological dictionary of Romanian language*, Bucharest, Editura Saeculum I.O., 2002 [1956-1966] (*Dicționarul etimologic al limbii române*).
- CoRoLA–*Electronic reference corpus for contemporary Romanian*, <http://corola.racai.ro/>(*Corpus computațional de referință pentru limba română contemporană*) (consultat în 15. 11. 2019- 03.12. 2019)
- Coromines, Joan, *Breve Diccionario Etimológico de la Lengua Castellana*, Madrid, Gredos, 2012.
- CORPES, *El corpus del español del siglo XXI*, <http://web.frl.es/CORPES/view/inicioexterno.view> (consultat în 15. 11. 2019- 03.12. 2019).
- DA =*Dictionary of Romanian language*, Bucharest, Editura Academiei Române, 1913-1949. (*Dicționarul limbii române*)
- DEX =*Explanatory dictionary of Romanian language*, Bucharest, Editura Univers Enciclopedic, 1998. (*Dicționarul explicativ al limbii române*)
- DLR =*Dictionary of Romanian language*, New series, Bucharest, Editura Academiei Române, 1958-2009.(*Dicționarul limbii române*)
- GALR =*Romanian Language Grammar*, vol. I: *Cuvântul*, vol. II: *Enunțul*, Bucharest, Editura Academiei Române, 2005. (*Gramatica limbii române*)
- Real Academia Española, *Diccionario de la lengua española*, 22^a edición, Madrid, Espasa Calpe, 2001.
- RDW = Tiktin, Hariton, Miron, Paul, *Rumänisch-Deutsches Wörterbuch*, Wiesbaden, Otto Harrassowitz Verlag 1986-1989.