

THE REALITY OF THE SUBSTANCE'S PARALOGISM IN VIOLIN MUSIC, THE „CHACONNE IN G MINOR” CASE. A PHENOMENOLOGIC CIRCULARITY ON THE IDEA OF ,BEAUTY' IN THE SOUNDS – THE LINE BACH – VITALI - HEIFETZ¹

MARIA-ROXANA BISCHIN²

SUMMARY. This article has a precise aim – to develop a deep research in the aesthetic of music and phenomenology of the music. Investigating some traditional sources as *Critique of the Pure Reason*, and the sources from Johann Sebastian Bach and Antonio Tomaso Vitali, we have observed a natural link between the idea of the 'substance' described by Immanuel Kant and the idea of the 'substance' in violin music. We have transpositioned the idea of the 'substance' in violin music. Even if the work written by Immanuel Kant appears after the signs of the musical Baroque as Bach – Vitali, we had considered that our perspective would be more interested if we will try to fix a paralogism of the substance in a composition named *Chaconne*. The *Chaconne* is a composition specific for the Baroque period, but which is well-known to be the most beautiful and the most complicated to be played for the violinists. There is a mysterious debate related to Chaconne, because due to the *Partita no.2 in D minor* by Bach, Vitali made it *Chaconna in G minor*. It has complex chromatic structures able to unify sounds which can express the sadness and human suffering with the most fastes sounds which express the tenderness and the silence, in perfection. For the conscience,

¹ Initially, the paper was written in English. English sources have been used to provide qualitative information about the violinist Jascha Heifetz. Most documents about Jascha Heifetz were donated by his family to the archives at the Library Congress in Washington (nomenclature index 20540, No. 2003561024). In these boxes we find music notes written by the violinist himself, we find some cuts and changes that Heifetz has written on Bach's songs, all the records of Heifetz's concerts, university lectures held by Heifetz at UCLA (University of California, Los Angeles). Besides these, we find many letters. Thus, there was direct correspondence with his professor Leopold Auer, composer William Walton, pianist Benjamin Britten and writer George Bernard Shaw.

² *Researcher in multiple areas of Arts & Aesthetics & Humanities (interdisciplinary researcher – History of Arts, Theory of Arts, Phenomenology), University of Bucharest, Email: <mariaartspy16@yahoo.com>. The researcher of this paper is also a multilingual person. For details, check <https://ro.linkedin.com/in/bischin-maria-roxana>.*

there is a symmetry in the *Chaconne* – because the ‘I’ can reach the most painful feelings with the most tender and healing states of the soul through the power of the sounds. Starting with the premise that the sounds have a deeply force for the manifestation of the lived facts of the conscience, we will try to see how *Chaconne* functions in this way linked by the paralogism of the substance and by the idea of the ‘Beauty’ of the sound.

Keywords: ‘Beauty’, sounds, violin’s tradition, phenomenological-hermeneutics of violin, substance, sonorous phenomenons, Kant, Tomaso Vitali, Bach, Jascha Heifetz, René-Charles “Zino” Francescatti, *Chaconne*.

1. Introduction

Well-known as the most complex and beautiful, strong and emotive composition, *Chaconne*/ or *Ciaconna* follows a very strong tradition which starts in Baroque. Firstly, Johann Sebastian Bach had composed the *Chaconne in D minor (Re minor)*, in 1717, named as *Partita no. 2*³ followed very soon by Antonio Tomaso Vitali which will change the game, and it will entitle it *Chaconne in G minor*.⁴ Listening to both of them, we discover a rare sense of the ‘Beauty’ which stands in them. Personally, we think the *Chaconne in G minor* is the softest way in which we can express the emotions, the tenderness, the sweet sadness – all together– because it will be (re)played with special techniques in twentieth century by two great violinists as Jascha Heifetz and René-Charles “Zino” Francescatti, even by George Enescu too.

Chaconne is hard to play on the violin, even if the violin won the title as being the most able instrument to reproduce the most unseen sounds related to human feelings. We think that in this play, a major role it will have some arguments from the paralogisms of the pure reason exposed by Immanuel Kant and some from the phenomenological field of investigation in

³ Johann Sebastian Bach, “Partita no. 2 in D minor”, in Lawrence Golan edition, *Three Sonatas and Three Partitas for Solo Violin*, BWV 1001-1006, (USA: Mel Bay Publication Pacific 2006), pp. 70-72. For other details see too Bach, Sebastian Johann (1720). *Adagio and Fugue for solo Violin in G minor*. BWV 1001, in *From 6 Sonatas in Violin Solo*, in Hans Wessely (ed.), (London: Joseph Williams, 1923).

⁴ This is the circular-way of the *Chaconne* in arrangements and transcripts after Vitali: First, we should recognize the contribution of Ferdinand David which had published for the first time the *Chaconne in G minor* (Antonio Tomaso Vitali) in die *Hohe Schule des Violinspiels*, no. 13, catalogue number ITV 1, 1867. The *Chaconne in G minor* was composed in 1745 or before by Antonio Tomaso Vitali, but there were some arrangements of the musical notes during next centuries made by Léopold Charlier (Leipzig: Breitkopf& Härtel, cca. 1911), by Ferdinand David, *Chaconne*, (Mainz: B. Schott’s Sohne, cca. 1900), and by Friedrich Hermann, *Ciaconna*, (Leipzig: Breitkopf und Hätel, 1899).

violin theory. According to Grahovac Vedran, the circularity will absorb itself into itself and will bring two terms, in our case to Heifetz and the cultural tradition in an asymmetric relation. However, this asymmetry will not remain closed in itself, as Vedran Grahovac mentioned, because sound cannot signify as a word an idea or a reference, but it signifies only the musical expression that takes the form of a non-articulated, verbalized language, (spoken). The *Chaconne*'s earthshaking refers to this circularity of our (spoken) language that remains open also because the language (spoken), as we have seen before, could only be modeled using musical techniques such as the passage of the Re minor in Sol minor. We believe, in this game a major role will be played by the Kantian argument transpositioned in the hermeneutics of the violin. In this case, we propose the term of the “circularity”⁵ with *phenomenological valences*⁶ on the idea of the ‘Beauty’ in the sounds, especially in *Chaconne*'s case. According to Grahovac Vedran, circularity will be absorbed itself into itself and will bring two terms into partial symmetry relations, in our case Jascha Heifetz and the cultural tradition. However, this asymmetry will not remain closed in itself, as Vedran Grahovac mentioned, because sound can not signify as a word an idea or a reference, but it signifies only the musical expression that takes the form of a non-articulated, verbalized language (spoken).

This article starts from the desire to find out if a philosopher can answer to fundamental questions about violin music. Therefore, we believe that from an aesthetic-ethical point of view, philosophy should be more deeply concerned with the phenomenon in potency and the phenomenon of reality which produces violin music. Especially, from an ethical perspective, a philosopher should be closer to violin music during his life. Therefore, some questions are about the continuity factor between the violinists from different centuries. Some questions pointed out the difference of the techniques used by violinists on the same composition. Some techniques in designing the sound are respecting the classical rules, but some of them are inventing something new, as in Jascha Heifetz's case. In this sense, Jascha Heifetz is a representative name in the violin culture of twentieth century. Next to him we can remember as well the experiments in the violin music of Paolo Bozzi, Itzhak Perlman and René Charles “Zino” Francescatti.

⁵ See Grahovac Vedran. *The Promise of Circularity in Husserl's Phenomenological Investigations*, original edition, University of Guelph, Ontario, november 2017, p. III: “The circularity on the first level describes terms in relation that are defined through their reference to each other: however, this relation between the two terms is not causal, for both terms remain self-enclosed. The second level of circularity indicates that the only possibility for the reciprocity or completion between two terms is through their self-encircling. The terms refer back and forth to each other precisely because they remain in a relational asymmetry.”

⁶ Author's note.

In this article we will focus in answer to the dilemma of the Kantian “substance” related to the life of the sounds. In this respect we will use some observations from *Critique of the Pure Reason*⁷, the edition from 1878’s.

We had observed that the sounds have a weight on the conscience of the listener and we are asking if this weight is the *substance* itself which spreads into the intellect and into the sensibility. But, on the other hand, if there is an ethical motivation in knowing hermeneutical the violin. How we meet these violin forces together? We think is more practical for a philosopher to starts playing the violin to understand for a few moments what is happening with the sensibility, conscience and emotions. The article also provokes us to ask ourselves how serious it is the field of music and where the experiment begins. So, the musical field is phenomenologically serious as it could be. For example, Paolo Bozzi is well-known for his masterclasses in which he combines the violin lessons with creative methods from philosophy or psychology. In this regard we are between “the limit of the psychological experience and the epistemic experience”⁸. We should explore them to find how the circularity functions for the Being. In these place intervenes the second circularity, the circularity of the idea of the ‘Beauty’. From an ethical-aesthetic perspective, philosophy should be more concerned with the phenomenon of potency and the phenomenon in reality detached from the sonorous substance⁹ of the violin.

Especially since, from an ethical perspective, a philosopher should try to be as close as possible to violin music throughout his life. So some questions about this research were about the continuity of the aesthetic preferences of violinists over the years. I have noted the difference of techniques used by violins for the same score. I noticed that some techniques meant to play the sound followed the classic rules, and others, like Heifetz's technique, brought something new. In this case, Heifetz is a representative name for the cultural horizon of the twentieth century violin. Along with him, we can also mention Leopold Auer, Itzhak Perlman, René Charles "Zino" Francescatti, or his father Reuven Heifetz.

⁷ See Immanuel Kant. *Critique of the Pure Reason*, trans. By J.M.D.Miklejohn, (London: Covent Graden, York Street, George Bell and Sons, 1878).

⁸ Maurizio Ferraris - Richard Davies. “3. Phenomenal experience, epistemic experience, and psychological Phenomenal experience, epistemic experience, and psychological experience: notes towards an epistemology of the phenomenological experimental method”, in Ivana Bianchi and Richard Davies (eds.), *Paolo Bozzi's Experimental Phenomenology*. in Ivana Bianchi and Richard Davies (eds.), (London: Routledge, 2018) : p. 64.

⁹ In the case of music, sound and substance become equivalent and will not function in opposition. The sonorous-circularity behaves like as a constant value in physics.

Also, Jascha Heifetz challenges us through this *Chaconne* to ask ourselves where music technique ends and where the experiment begins. Therefore, the musical technique keeps up with a phenomenological status of the creator¹⁰, due to the high degree of seriousness involved in the performance of the score. For example, Paolo Bozzi is well-known for his courses combining violin lessons with creative methods in philosophy and psychology. In this sense, the "limit between psychological experience and epistemic experience"¹¹ is reached, and precisely this limitation would place the creator / interpreter in his phenomenological status. We should explore these experiences precisely in order to find the functioning of the circularity for the Being. In this place, there is the second circularity - the circularity of the "Beauty" idea that overlaps the idea of "substance".

The newest investigations by Simon Høffding talk about the „musical absorption“¹². Is he talking about the absorption of the Being, of the conscience, about the judgement of perception- completely immersed in the “ocean” of the conscience? What is in fact our entire diving into the violin music? Investigating the principle of the substance in things, we conclude that the sounds have substance. In violin music, this substance is the vibration of the violin and of the soul.

More than that, we want to demonstrate that the ‘Beauty’ is a permanent existence in the sonorous phenomena, that in their account we can live the sadness, the ‘Beauty’ of the sadness, but also other lived intentional or (non)intentional facts of the Being in its own *absorptional* universe of the Becoming. So, there is a weight of the substance in the sounds manifested as being ‘Beauty’. From a personal point of view, we think that Being can not live without sounds. The senses produced by the sounds and the hypnotic effect that music produces for the spirit are inevitable.

¹⁰ The phenomenological status of the creator designates the cohesion between the circularity of the hermeneutical situations and the circularity of the experiences in relation to certain knowledge acquired through practice. From a phenomenological point of view, this would also imply the intentionality between the hermeneutical situation and its own circularity.

¹¹ Maurizio Ferraris - Richard Davies. “3. Phenomenal experience, epistemic experience, and psychological Phenomenal experience, epistemic experience, and psychological experience: notes towards an epistemology of the phenomenological experimental method”, in Ivana Bianchi and Richard Davies (ed.), *Paolo Bozzi's Experimental Phenomenology*, în Ivana Bianchi and Richard Davies (ed.), Londra, Routledge, 2018, p. 64.

¹² Simon Høffding. “2. How should we study Musical Absorption”, *A Phenomenology of Musical Absorption. New Directions in Philosophy and Cognitive Science* (Switzerland: Palgrave Macmillan, 2019): pp. 13–45.

2. The substance's paralogism¹³ between the reality of the sound and the sonorous phenomenon

Our challenge is to think if there is a 'Beauty' of the substance that Immanuel Kant is so often talking about. Hence, the question naturally derives, how can be this substance 'Beautiful'. What we are understanding through 'Beautiful'? Something which is inevitable beautiful, or something which exceeds the limits of the generally 'Beauty'? If we place ours in this situation as Being, we discover that we are unable to define the Beauty that breaks the imaginary and the real limits one at a time. The philosopher confronted with such an impossibility will start to wonder even more obsessively what is behind the sounds. Those sounds created in the plane of the self ("I") tell us a story that we can easily visualize; the sounds can even create the feeling of a safe and warm place or the sense that we have come to a place without the risk of getting lost.

Samuel Applebaum says that producing a «*beautiful*» sound depends on the experience of the violinist: "you should play a series of long notes of different qualities. They should range from scratchy sounds to beautiful tones"¹⁴. We think the epistemic experience plays an important role too, as the real one. In this sense, a conflict between quality and substance is created. We should remember that accordingly to Immanuel Kant, the substance is a pure category. In Kantian theory, the quality is seen as something difficult when we talk about the reality. This is the argument from Kant:

All sensations therefore as such are given only à posteriori, but this property therefor, namely, that they have a degree, can be known à priori. It is worthy of remark, that in respect to quantities in general, we can cognize à priori only a single quality, namely, continuity; but, in respect to all quality (the real in phenomena), we cannot cognize à priori anything more than the intensive quantity, therefor, namely, that they have a degree. All else is left

¹³ See, Immanuel Kant. *Transcendental Dialectic- Book II- On the Paralogism of pure Reason, Critique of the Pure Reason*, trans. By J.M.D.Miklejohn (London: Covent Graden, York Street, George Bell and Sons, 1878) : p. 239: "*The soul is SUBSTANCE.*" We say in an improper way "the substance's paralogism", because in *Critique of the Pure Reason* exists only the pralogisms of the pure reason. But the first paralogism mentioned by Kant is that the soul is substance, so we think we should provide in this manner the *paralogism of the substance* as an independent one in the history of the paralogisms of the pure reason. In this way, we introduce a similarity between the "I" and the "substance" which is quite different from the "I" understood as "intellect".

¹⁴ Samuel Applebaum. "Q. When do you strat discussing beautiful tone production with the students?", *The Art and Science of String Performance*. Ed. de Thomas Lindsay, first published in 1986 (USA: Alfred Music, 2005) : p. 118.

to experience.¹⁵ Ruth Katz considers that if the violinist will contribute with his fingers-technique and with his voice, the effect of the knowledge will be double - “hearing the sound of a voice and a violin, which implies the independence of the sound (...). Sound will normally contribute to perception by providing knowledge”¹⁶.

*A position midway between personal expression and outside phenomenon is occupied by the sounds arising from instruments we play ourselves. Such sounds are already approximated by clapping and even by whistling as contrasted with the directly expressive character of the voice; but a musical instrument or any sound producer can flexibly register our intent becomes at once an extension of our natural expressive facilities and purposes as well as an independent external object. And similarly, the sound it produces will not have only an obvious origin in an external source but also a close connection – with our corporeal sonorities and resonances, and we will feel in any event that our inner experience is finding a direct and immediate sonorous expression.*¹⁷

We want to detail the expression “corporeal sonorities”. This sonorities are felt by our body, but by our conscience too. The feeling is similar with putting a warmy coat on our body. Even if the sound will not physically touch our body, they can make it vibrate. This makes an echo in conscience too, the place were we obtain the most part of the expression of the understanding process. The phenomenological circularity is in this way opened for the Being. We should complete that the sonorous expression becomes the substance of the music and lived-fact for conscience. Nevertheless, in respect of all phaenomena, consequentlly of all things which come within the sphere of our experience, it is neccesarily objective. We cannot say “all thing are in time”, because in this conception of things, because in this conception of things in general, we abstract and make no mention of any sort of intuition of things. But this is the proper condition under which time belongs to our representation of objects. If we add the condition to the conception, and say “all things as phenomena, that is, objects of sensuous intuition, are in time”, then the proposition has its sound objective validity and universally à priori.¹⁸

¹⁵ Kant (1878): p. 132. In the 1878s edition „therefore” is written in a short form as „therefor”.

¹⁶ Edward A. Lippman. “A Humanistic Philosophy of Music”, in Ruth Katz, Carl Dahlhaus (eds.), *Contemplating Music: Source Readings in the Aesthetics of Music*, vol. 4 *Community of Discourse*, folia *Aesthetics in Music No. 5*, (New York: Pendragon Press Stuyvesant, 1993), p. 196.

¹⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 196.

¹⁸ Kant (1878), p. 31.

Kant talks in this context about “the empirical reality of time”¹⁹. We are wondering if the “epistemic” condition of the experience mentioned before by Maurizio Ferraris²⁰ is in conflict with the empirical condition of the time. The sounds become part of the temporality in double circularity: first of all, is the tradition which must continue along the years. Secondly, is the temporal internal condition of the *Chaconne* – it reconditions itself something for our inner experience and knowledge. There must be a *substance* to unify the empirical time with the epistemic experience of the violinist. Accordingly to Alex Byrne, and from our phenomenological perspective, the violinist experience of the sounds, makes possible the perception and the judgement of the perception, or the “perceptual knowledge”²¹. This knowledge offers the possibility to see despite traditional continuity exists a residence place for intuitions and judgements. We can derive from here a judgement of the sonorous facts²², to include sensible intuitions and perceptual judgements into a sonorous circularity. That was Bach, Vitali and Heifetz, and others made.

3. Substantialist continuity on the line Bach-Vitali–Heifetz-Francescatti

Substantialism in the musical culture should be understood as the manifestation of the sound in its entire fullness. For the musical phenomenon, this substantialism has much to do with the concept of the ‘feeling’. When we talk about substantialism in music, we certainly talk about the phenomenological side of the music.

How can we integrate the concept of the substance in the cultural continuity? In the violin music we have the so-called “tradition”, which is an effect of the cultural continuity. How can we have a cultural continuity? The first time when Antonio Vitali Tomamaso wrote his «Chaconne» was in 1744s-1745s, after the «Ciaconna / Partita no. 2» by Bach from 1717s. But when Jascha Heifetz will replay the song, it will be in XXth century, in the period of the musical Neoclassicism. In this way ,we observe that condition of time is which maintains the similarities between the two violinists – as saying the pure intuitions of the intellect. Do we have two different traditions? Yes, we have - the Heifetz’s tradition and the Vitali’s tradition. The unity between them is possible due to the cultural horizon and because of the *intuitive* character of the time.

¹⁹ *Loc. cit.*

²⁰ See, Maurizio Ferraris (2018).

²¹ Alex Byrne. “The significance of the epistemic experience”, in *Philosophical Studies* 173 (4), (Springer Netherlands: MIT Press, 2015) pp. 951–953.

²² Note of the author.

Another idea which we should take into account is that playing the same melody, collides with the question which from two reinterpretation is most 'Beautiful', or which represents the best the idea of the 'Beauty' of the sounds. This is not hard to find. Firstly, we recommend that each person should individual listen the play by Vitali and second the play of Heifetz. The beauty of the sounds will be re-filled in the conscience as being part of the Vitali's universe. Heifetz offers us an open place for the Vitalian tradition. In XX century we should remember Richard Strauss' important works. This continuity becomes a mirror of the classic period which had collided with the Illuminist tradition. The tradition starts with Johann Sebastian Bach, but despite this, there exists a tradition in the reproducing technique of the sounds. The tradition was respected by Martin Schleske, the violin-builder:

“But the idea itself, to again turn to Bach’s Ciaconna, came from lecture of a book by a LIVING MASTER in living construction, who might be SINCE CENTURIES THE FIRST working on the SIMPLE LEVEL as the old Italian masters from Cremona – at around at the start of 18th century, so that these are contemporary to Bach. I am speaking of MARTIN SCHLESKE²³ and his VERY COMPLICATED and SOPHISTICATED approach to music, to PHYSICS of sound to philosophical-spiritual horizons even of some genuine Christian sort and charme.”²⁴

As we can see, the tradition of the *Ciaconna* starts with contemporaries violinists with Bach. But, Vitali also has been contemporary with Bach, so later with Willibard Gluck and Immanuel Kant, so we have a linear continuity in this cultural product of the 18th century. But we also find that *Chaconne in G minor* was known due to Vitali, because of the tonality in G minor²⁵. What had happened after 18th century with this *Chaconne* was the best. It has inspired the ballet field, the cinematography area and literature. From a sociological point of view, we can say that it saved Heifetz from the nazist propaganda later in Germany.

²³ Martin Schleske is a violin sculptor, his violins are named “individuelle Klangskulpturen [individual sonorous-sculptures]”, for details, see Martin Schleske, *Meisteratelier für Geigenbau*, <http://www.schleske.de/>, accessed March 18, 2019.

²⁴ Bruno Antonio Bruke - Ferruccio Busoni. *Ciaconna/ Chaconne* (from Partita II for solo violine, BWV 1004), set to a great organ from version for solo piano by Ferruccio Busoni – experiment superieur- (Silbermann of French Cathedral BBWV 76, lenght 12:11) (Germany: Neuss, 2013) : p. III.

²⁵ For details, see Hermann Keller. „Die Chaconne g-Moll von- Vitali?“, in *Neue Zeitschrift für Musik*, vol. 125, (Leipzig: B. Schott's Söhne, 1964): p. 147.

Joschua Waggener placed the violin music between the feeling of healing, and the feeling of a mystery.²⁶ Behind the so-called mystery, *Mysterium Tremendum*, there exists the mystery of the existence which each violinist will be focused on.

Not by accident, Christoph Willibard Gluck composed the music for *Orfeo ed Euridice*²⁷, which will be later be used in the ballet with the same name of George Balanchine. We should take into account that in his ballet from 1963/1976²⁸, he used a continuity of the dance *Chaconne*. As we see, in last centuries cultural horizon, *Chaconne* creates an equilibrium between dance and violin music. The physic of the sound was able to unify these philosophical-horizons too.

Now, we will try an exercise of imagination: what if Kant would have been written something about violin? He could have been written separated from a transcendental paralogism of the violin music, from which he would derive the concept of the substance. If his construction "I think"²⁹ is the so-called substance, then we should see if the music is the "I" and the "substance" together. To unify the "I" with the substance, we need a strong intuition between them. When the sonorous phenomenon is in the room we feel how our "I" becomes the same thing with the sounds with the principal condition then it will listen to the sounds. Why are we saying this? Because in the process of listening with attention, we activate the reflexive form of the judgement. We tend to mention that the substance lives in this reflexive form of the intellect. When this is happens there is a manifested unity between sounds and the 'I', which is a circularity in substantialism³⁰.

Now, we take other argument for the historical continuity in violin music. Antonio Vivaldi wrote *L'Estro Armonico* in 1711, a compendium of violin melodies dedicated to the Ferdinand III of Tuscany – "All Altezza Reale di Fernando III. Gran Principe di Toscana"³¹. As we know, Vivaldi uses a very

²⁶ Joschua Waggener. "9. C.P.E. Bach's *Heilig* and the 'Holy' of Rudolf Otto: An Eighteenth-Century Experience of the *Mysterium Tremendum*", *Music and Transcendence*, ed. Férdia J. Stone-Davis, (London and New York: Routledge Taylor&Francis Group, 2016): pp. 113–125.

²⁷ Christoph Willibard Gluck. *Orfeo ed Euridice*, wq. 30, first performed in Viena, 5th October 1762. Partiture 2008, Performer's Reprints.

²⁸ George Balanchine, ballet *Chaconne* (1963–1976), with music composed in *Orfeo ed Euridice*, by Christoph Willibard Gluck (1762), in Richard Buckle, John Taras (eds.), *George Balanchine, ballet master: a biography*, (New York: Random House 1988) : pp. 291– 292: "Balanchine had staged dances for the final scene of Gluck's *Orfeo* at the Hamburg State Opera as early as 1963; in 1975 he presented his own company in *Chaconne* which took its final form for the following spring when he added an opening ensemble before the first duet."

²⁹ Kant (1787): pp. 238–239.

³¹ See, Antonio Vivaldi. *L'Estro Armonico*(opus 3) *Libro primo* and *Libro secundo* (6 concertos), edited Roger Marchand (Amsterdam: Libraire de Michel Charles Le Cene, 1712–1713).

fast technique in executing the sounds, very similar to Chaconne of Vitali. I here we should talk about the sensibility of the tactile sense of the hands. For the violinist, the hands are special forms of knowing the sounds, we can say metaphorically in "touching them". This thing means a rigorous equilibrium between the finger, the strings and the visualization in the conscience of the musical notes. The memory plays an important role in shaping some of the paralogisms of the pure reason. We want to introduce the term of the *tactile memory* to define the capacity of one person to remember something through his fingers.

Dario Sarlo in the *Performance Style of Jascha Heifetz* says that in Bach's case the substance consists in the speed of the notes.³² In consequence, the substance is related to the time and to the sound-times. Dario Sarlo shows us some example from Pablo de Sarasate or Carl Flesch³³ – cases in which the substantialism is manifested through the sonorous-times. The continuity can be manifested through the instrument itself, when we see on how many violins played Heifetz:

*“Heifetz owned a number of notable instruments during his lifetime, starting with a 1736 Carlo Tononi³⁴ violin which his father bought him in 1914 and on which Heifetz played his Carnegie Hall debut and his earliest recordings. Heifetz left this instrument to his student Sherry Kloss. Later instruments included the 1714 ‘Dolphin’ Stradivarius and Heifetz favourite, the 1742 David / Heifetz Guarneri del Gesù³⁵.”³⁶ But this continuity is not manifested only through an instrument, but it is manifested through some masters of violin that Heifetz followed: “Heifetz was one of the most successful recording artists of his generation. He worked with Emanuel Feuerman, Sergei Koussevitzky, Gregor Piatigorsky, Artur Rubinstein, Arturo Toscanini, William Walton, and many others. He also performed and recorded with many of the world's great orchestras. Heifetz played himself in a Hollywood movie entitled *They Shall Have Music* in 1939 and in 1946 also appeared in *Carnegie Hall*.”³⁷ Heifetz's personality will inspire the public audience.*

³² Dr. Dario Sarlo. part III. 6. “Tempo and Duration in Heifetz's solo Bach”, *Performance Style of Jascha Heifetz*, (London: printed by Henry Ling Limited, Ashgate Publishing, Dorset Press, 2015): p. 101.

³³ *Ibid.*, p. 102.

³⁴ For details, see ‘Focus on Tononi 1736 Violin’, *The Strad*, vol 106, nr. 1257, pp. 50–51. DOI: <https://openmusiclibrary.org/article/768455/>.

³⁵ For details see, “Guarneri Exhibition Report”, *The Strad*, vol. 106, nr. 1260, pp. 375–379. DOI: <https://openmusiclibrary.org/article/768503/>.

³⁶ Sarlo (2015), part I.1. “Heifetz and the Bach Solo Violin Works”, p. 12.

³⁷ *Loc. cit.*

“Examining the Heifetz’s performances in the movie They Shall Have Music (1939) and his performance of the Tchaikovsky Concerto in Carnegie Hall (1946) reveals that to some extent, he does often make ‘more pronounced movements at the boundary points’ and it can be seen ‘surging forwards at a rising crescendo’. There are, however, an equal number of times throughout footage when Heifetz plays highly charged passages with a ‘deadpan’ expression. A prime example can be found in the They Shall Have Music in the performance of Mendelssohn Concerto with an orchestra of children. Heifetz plays the virtuosic and and passionate few lines with hardly any change of facial expression. He keeps his torso almost motionless and his violin in a perfect horizontal position. Nevertheless, the violin playing is full of energy. Heifetz seems to be an unusual case; he succeeds in engaging his audience despite the severely restricted performative gestures.”³⁸

Accordingly to Joshua S. Walden, these performances on violin have as reference the rural life from villages where dances as follia or chaconna are played by the people. For example, not far from Vitali, Vivaldi will write *La Follia* after the medieval Portuguese dance entitled *follia*. In this respect, we have found some cultural similarities in violin music between Bach, Vitali and Vivaldi. More than that, Heifetz had continued this tradition:

“By staging that they incorporated “collected” and “traditional” melodies into their compositions, these program notes depict Sarasate, Achron and Dvorak as ethnographers of a sort, bringing melodies from remote areas to urban audiences in their compositions. Heifetz’s performance, in turn, is expected to bring listeners back in the opposite directions, provokes them to “wander to distant times and far-off climes.” The urban listener was presented with an opportunity to participate in an imaginary ethnographic field trip, with the timbres of Heifetz’s playing standing in for those of the musicians who performed the original music artifacts in rural areas, as well as serving as a medium to evoke the sounds, sights, and smells of distant landscapes and cultures. Heifetz himself was sometimes depicted in his recital programs as an exotic relic of the distant East³⁹, as in a handbill for a 1919 performance in

³⁸ *Ibid.*, Part III, Chapter I, “Heifetz and the Bach Solo Violin Works”, “The Heifetz Musical Persona”, p. 45.

³⁹ For details, Galyna Kopytova, in collaboration with Albina Starkova-Heifetz, “First Performances in St. Petersburg”, *Jascha Heifetz. Early Years in Russia*, translated by Dario Sarlo and Alexandra Sarlo, (Indianapolis & Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2004) : pp. 70–82.

*Michigan that cast him as a quasi-Messianic presence providing a direct connection to a different era and place (...).*⁴⁰

Heifetz was looking obtaining a faster rhythm and a great sonorous-emphasis after the *Partita no. 2*.⁴¹ But despite this element, there is a superposition between Vitalis- Bach technique, with elements from *Adagio in G minor*⁴² by Bach. All of these searches may have conducting Heifetz in finding the manner to make the *Chaconne* more sensitive, more poetical, even more profoundly transcendental.

René-Charles Zino Francescatti was also preoccupied in playing *Chaconne* to the Carnegie Hall. Accordingly to Virgil Thomson, he played in one night “Faure’s Sonata in A major, Ravel’s Berceuse and Tzigane, Bach’s *Chaconne*, Stravinsky’s *Duo Concertant*, and three pieces by Fritz Kleiser. Accompanist, Arthur Balsam, piano”⁴³. Francescatti plays a rich repertory, and had offered to the *Chaconne* a palce in between the rural-compositions by Ravel. Virgil Thomson characterizes Francescattii as being “depth, breadth, and lucidity”⁴⁴.

4. The Beauty of the reality imposed by substance and the psychological synaesthesia

To a first view, the Beauty derives from the sound. But behind this aspects, we think that the violinist’s technique makes it real. The technique of the fingers is th instrument that makes real the sounds. The sensations are unified with the perceptions through technique and intellect. The finger technique is a tool / tool of the second degree that determines the faithful playback of the sounds. The sensations are united with the perceptions through technique and intellect. What would be the role of synaesthesia? In this context, synesthesia⁴⁵ it would (re) be defined, not as a link between

⁴⁰ Joshua S. Walden. “1. 2. The Rural Miniature in Performance and Sound Recording”, *Sounding Authentic: The Rural Miniature and Musical Modernism*, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2014): p.67.

⁴¹ See, Dario Sarlo (2015), p.63 , next p. 122.

⁴² Johann Sebastian Bach. 1720, *Adagio and Fugue for solo Violin in G minor*. BWV 1001, *From 6 Sonatas in Violin Solo*, in Hans Wessely (ed.), (London: Joseph Williams, 1923).

⁴³ Virgil Thomson. in Tim Page (ed.), *Music Chronicles 1940-1954. Musical Scene. The Art of Judging Music. Music Right and Left. Music Reviewed. Other Writings*, (New York: Literary Classics of the United States, 2014): pp. 366. More than that, he talks about the musical taste and about the concept of “the taste survey” (p. 798-800) in the cultural tradition of the continuity.

⁴⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 367.

⁴⁵ Vezi, Jonathan M. Bokrum. “Creativity, Synesthesia, and Physiognomic Perception”, în *Creativity Research Journal*, nr. 10, vol. 1, 1997, pp. 1–8.

several impressions, but as a unity between the reflexive form of technique and impressions resulting from sounds:

“Producing a sound is a sensation. That sensation is one of pulling or drawing the tone from the instrument rather than pressing it out. That is a knack that players must discover through practice and experimentation.”⁴⁶ Where begins the synaesthesia of the sounds? And when? We think the effect of a deeply musical synaesthesia starts with our feelings which are in a Brownian moving with the instrument. Here is a new perspective from Tim Hodgkinson: “Pain is an image, sound is an image, this page is an image. I mean that they appear to us. These images are finely collated out of tiny informations rising in the afferent nervous system. They are transitory patternings of neuronal activity, momentary states of plastic and holistic medium.”⁴⁷

In contradiction with Tim Hodgkinson, we say pain is not only a image, but is a real substantialism derived from the paralogism of the soul. If we talk about a sad melody, then we should take into account the idea of a synaesthesia of the pain, of the sadness, which through violin sound it remains in a substantiality of the idea of the ‘Beauty’. There is a reality of the Beauty into the sadness, into the pain. We think humanity could not become better if it is not exposed to the pain borrowed even from the real world (wars), even from the interior of the Being. More than that, the ‘Beauty’ of the *Chaconne* was very well displayed by George Balanchine on the stage. He produces the beauty of the motion derivated from the substantialism of the violin music:

“(...) the ballerina’s eyes follows her flowing arm or looks down at her nimble feet; the man admires his partner’s pirouettes or extends the line of her arabesque with his arms. Movement is displayed. Sometimes what is displayed is fantastic virtuosity, but not always. Balanchine’s dancers sometimes, as in Chaconne, just walk-simply, and not at all simply, they walk. How beautiful a walk can be when it is not trying to get somewhere!”⁴⁸

⁴⁶ Applebaum (2005) : p. 118.

⁴⁷ Tim Hodgkinson. *Music and the Myth of the Wholeness. Toward a new Aesthetic Paradigm.* Massachusetts, Cambridge: MIT Press, 2016, p. 5.

⁴⁸ Selma Jeanne Cohen. “Verbs of Motion”, in *Next Week, Swan Lake: Reflections on Dance and Dancers*, (Middletown, Connecticut: Wesleyan University Press, 1982): p.123.

What makes these things real for the consciousness and the physical world is the violinist's technique (or *technical synesthesia*⁴⁹). The "Beauty" sentiment was connected to the music and philosophy of the eighteenth century. Beethoven has made this a field of aesthetics: Listening to the *Chaconne in G minor* played by Jascha Heifetz and by Tomaso Vitali we feel that a sound unifies itself with other sound in a tender manner. We have monochords which will birth beautiful harmonic chords. This is a reality too, because which makes this things to be real for the conscience and for the physical world is the technique of the violinist. The feeling of the 'Beauty' was related to music and philosophy since 18th century . Beethoven made an aesthetic field from this:

*“Beethoven put unusual stress on melodic beauty, especially in his opening themes. The concept of beauty (Schönheit) was the central subject in aesthetics as it emerged in the eighteenth century as a branch of philosophy. What constitutes the beautiful and how taste and experience should intermingle in judgements of such qualities as the sublime and the beautiful had been among the principal questions discussed by writers ranging from Burke, in his Philosophical Enquiry into the Origins of our Ideas of the Sublime and the Beautiful (1757), to Kant, in his Critique of Judgement (1791). The literature on the subject grew and intensified during Beethoven’s early years, and especially between about 1800 and 1810, a number of tracts by German writers appeared. Some of these writers were loyally Kantian.”*⁵⁰

Literature on the subject grew and intensified during Beethoven's early years, but especially between 1800 and 1810, when a number of German writer's treatises appeared. Some of these writers were Kantians.⁵¹ Now, the challenge is to see if the 20th century tradition of the *Chaconne*, on the line Francescatti-Heifetz is Kantian. The answer is yes, and we will argue in this respect with some arguments, as the following:

⁴⁹ Author's note.

⁵⁰ Lewis Lockwood. "2. "On the Beautiful in Music": Beethoven's Spring Sonata for Violin and Piano, Opus 24", in ed. Lewis Lockwood and Mark Kroll, *The Beethoven Violin Sonatas: History, Criticism, Performance* , (Illinois, Chicago: University of Illinois Press, Urbana Chicago, 2004) : p. 40.

⁵¹ Lewis Lockwood. "2. "On the Beautiful in Music": Beethoven's Spring Sonata for Violin and Piano, Opus 24", în Lewis Lockwood și Mark Kroll (eds.), *The Beethoven Violin Sonatas: History, Criticism, Performance* , Illinois, Chicago, University of Illinois Press, Urbana Chicago, 2004, p. 40.

(i) the substance of the musicality of the Chaconne manifests as unifying the sensible parts of the conscience as taste-judgement, tactile-judgement and the Husserlian judgement of perception with the pure emotions. The emotions transmitted through this piece are pure. In this regard, we argue with a cite from the Johann Brahms' *Letters to Carla Schumann*, just because this piece – the Chaconne is such a moving melody:

*“On one stave, for a small instrument, the man writes a whole world of the deepest thoughts and most powerful feelings. If I have imagined that I could have created, even conceived the piece, I am quite certain that the excess of excitement and earthshattering experience would have driven me out of my mind.”*⁵²

(ii) When we try to reproduce this earthshattering experience by ourselves, we feel how the substance of the melody manifests through our tactile-judgement and our intellect charged yet with sensibilities.

Edmund Burke agrees that “sounds have a great power”⁵³ on our sensations and perceptions related to the idea of ‘Beautiful’. Also, he said that “beauty is not disproportion or deformity”⁵⁴. What is *Beautiful* in Beethoven’s sonatas or in Heifetz, is Beautiful because there is no deformity into the sounds, even when they express the violence of the passion or the violence of the purest sadness. If the passion is the body from Edmund Burke’s treatise, in a sonorous universe, it will attend to be similar to ethical love:

*“Which shews that beauty and the passion caused by beauty, which I call love, is different from desire, though desire may sometimes operate along with it; but it is to this latter that we must attribute those violent and tempestuous passions, and the consequent emotions of the body which attend what is called love in some of its ordinary acceptations, and not to the effects of beauty merely as it is such.”*⁵⁵

In another perspective of Edmund Burke's idea, the passion guided by the Beauty is that which gives birth to the Beauty of a violin song as Chaconne - that is in the same time stormy, calm, warm, violent. Going

⁵² “The Chaconne (Ciaconna) in D minor”, in The Wikipedians (eds.), *Johann Sebastian Bach: The Complete Guide*, (2008): p. 423, *apud Letters of Clara Schumann and Johannes Brahms, 1853-1896*, in Berthold Litzmann ed., Viena, 1971.

⁵³ Edmund, Burke. *A philosophical Enquiry into the Origin of our Ideas of the Sublime and Beautiful*, third Edition, (London: Printed for R. And J. Dodsley, MDCCLXI/ 1759): pp. 150–151.

⁵⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 191.

⁵⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 163.

further with our investigation, even if the musical language of the violin produces emotions, the emotion plays between her objective and subjective parts. There is a specific objective intersubjectivity in Chaconne.

“Yet I hesitate to say ‘emotion’, precisely because that which is emotion, is not always the subjective, that is, the emotion prevailing in the soul that very moment. The subjective, I said before, can become the objective and now I am saying that it is possible for the expression to become painting in a similar way.”⁵⁶

So, the emotions produced by the virtuosity of the violinist are objective because there are generated through a technique. In this case, the violinist is subjective because he chooses the way in which he plays Chaconne, The effect which are produced call them objective emotions. But if there is objective as well, they could be called as well pure emotions of a deeply intellectualised sensibility. Every moment translated the emotion in the duration of the conscience. But these makes the Beauty of the sounds possible. The sounds are something natural, so naturality is herself necessarily ‘beautiful’ so we can say that Naturality means ‘Beauty’, without necessary being Beauty. If there is an equivalent between naturality and Beauty⁵⁷, then the judgement of taste and the aesthetic value⁵⁸, in violin music case, are contributing to bring more valences to the concept of the ‘Beauty’.

Conclusions

If we should formulate some conclusions about the reality and probability of the sounds, then we should say that the music is real. There is no other reality of the idea of the ‘Beauty’ behind this. In psychological way, the sounds are realities for the mind, and, in phenomenological way, lived real facts for conscience. This is a powerful reason to see that the paralogism of the sonorous substance becomes real. The painter Paul Klee said that the art should be a vibration derived from the rhythm.

⁵⁶ J.J.Engel. “Über die Musikalische Malerei”, in Ruth Katz, Carl Dahlhau (eds.), *Contemplating Music: Source Readings in the Aesthetics of Music*, Vol. III *Essence*, Aesthetics in Music no. 5, (New York: Pendragon Press Stuyvesant): pp. 135–136.

⁵⁷ For details, see, Virgil Thomas.“The Art of Judging Music”, in *ed. cit.*, 2014, pp. 305–312. A melody should be listen, should be read with precise taste of a professionalism – only in this situation we can estimate the value of a melody. More than that, from a phenomenological point of view, we shoul live what the melody says to us. We should vibrate with it in a sincerely way.

⁵⁸ For details, Victor Zuckerkrandl. “Sound and Symbol” in Ruth Katz, Carl Dahlhau (eds.), vol. III, pp. 667–668.

The sonorous-event is not probability, it is a potentiality of the reality of the sonorous substantialism. We are proposing term sonorous-event to indicate the reality or the sustained reality of the sound through hands, strings and intellect. The Beauty of the sound is derived from the substantialism of the sonorous-event.

Where there is destruction, music can build, where it is suffering, music can heal, not only from the point of view of the unity between the psychic and the sensations we receive from violin music, but especially for consciousness. For consciousness, any sound vibration is lived in the most intense way. It is a circle of fullness, a circularity of the fullness of the Being. From here derives that Beauty that is experienced for consciousness: the beauty of sadness, the beauty of the flowing time, the “sublime” invoked by Edmund Burke, or the sensitivity invoked by Immanuel Kant. In this way, we have answered the question of what is the phenomenological lived-fact in violin music – it is that flood of the Being with the sublimation of the Beauty. This suppose to touch in a mentally way the perfection of all the feelings, even if there are negative or positive. There is a Beauty in every feeling and lived-fact birth from this circularity of the consciousness’ plenitude. Below is a personal view of the floating and unsettling Beauty of this *Chaconne*:

“There are more ups and downs in a melody that apparently should calm you ... The way in which this Chaconne starts, and leaves place for silence, and afterwards the sounds to climb smoothly, then pause to make a continuous break, then come back to shouting to take another stronger boost. It’s Chaconne’s way, it’s like life itself. As interpreter, you will know this double or triple torment – the addiction for each sound, involves a considerable effort, a fingers’ fatigue on the strings, a torture of them to refusal, but with a noble purpose, the one to get that very sharp turn, but not to slander our ears, but to calm down in a pleasant way, such that the Being which listens to you suddenly feels a fascinating tenderness of pain and happiness in tandem “caught” in the same sound trap. When you listen to it is even harder, because you cut out all the restlessness Chaconne causes you alive. You can not hide anything. When you stand face to face with the violin you can not hide, you can not put a mask, because it will be against you... The instrument itself forces you to do this; it is natural, because it comes from natural wood and at least the minimum it requires from you – to be you like him too.”⁵⁹

⁵⁹ Maria-Roxana Bischin, annotations on *Chaconne in G minor* exposed to the Doctoral School’s Conference in Philosophy, «Reality and appearance, evidence and probability – new directions in philosophical research», 10 may 2019, Bucharest.

REFERENCES

- Applebaum, Samuel (2005). *The Art and Science of String Performance*. Ed. de Thomas Lindsay, first published in 1986. USA: Alfred Music.
- Bach, Johann Sebastian (2006). “Partita no. 2 in D minor”, written between 1717-1720, in Lawrence Golan edition, *Three Sonatas and Three Partitas for Solo Violin*, BWV 1001-1006. USA: Mel Bay Publication Pacific2006. 70–72.
- Bokrum, Jonathan M. “Creativity, Synesthesia, and Physiognomic Perception”, in *Creativity Research Journal*, nr. 10, vol. 1, 1997, pp. 1–8.
- Bruike, Antonio Bruno; Busoni, Ferruccio (2013). *Ciaconna/ Chaconne (from Partita II for solo violine, BWV 1004), set to a great organ from version for solo piano by Ferruccio Busoni – experiment superieur- (Silbermann of French Cathedral BBWV 76)*. Germany: Neuss.
- Buckle, Richard (1988). George Balanchine, ballet *Chaconne* (1963-1976), with music composed in *Orfeo ed Euridice*, by Christoph Willibard Gluck (1762), in Richard Buckle, John Taras (eds.), *George Balanchine, ballet master: a biography*. New York: Random House.
- Burke, Edmund (MDCCLXI/ 1759). *A philosophical Enquiry into the Origin of our Ideas of the Sublime and Beautiful*. Third Edition. London: Printed for R. And J. Dodsley.
- Byrne, Alex (2015). “The significance of the epistemic experience”, in *Philosophical Studies* 173 (4). Springer Netherlands: MIT Press: 947–967. Pages cited in text 951–953. DOI: <http://hdl.handle.net/1721.1/103433>.
- Cohen, Selma Jeanne (1982). “Verbs of Motion”, *Next Week, Swan Lake: Reflections on Dance and Dancers*, Middletown, Connecticut: Wesleyan University Press.
- Engel, J.J. (1992). “Über die Musikalische Malerei”. Ivana Bianchi and Richard Davies (eds.), *Contemplating Music: Source Readings in the Aesthetics of Music*, Vol. III *Essence*, Aesthetics in Music no. 5. New York: Pendragon Press Stuyvesant. 128–140.
- Ferraris, Maurizio; trans. Davies, Richard (2018). “Part I, Chapter 3. Phenomenal experience, epistemic experience, and psychological experience: notes towards an epistemology of the phenomenological experimental method”. Ivana Bianchi and Richard Davies (eds.). *Paolo Bozzi's Experimental Phenomenology*. London: Routledge. 64–78.
- Høffding, Simon (2019). *A Phenomenology of Musical Absorption. New Directions in Philosophy and Cognitive Science*. Switzerland: Palgrave Macmillan. / New Directions in Philosophy and Cognitive Sciences.
- Hodgkinson, Tim (2016). *Music and the Myth of the Wholeness. Toward a new aesthetic paradigm*. Massachusetts, Cambridge: MIT Press.
- Kant, Immanuel (1) (1878). *Critique of the Pure Reason*. Trans. By J.M.D.Miklejohn. London: Covent Garden, York Street, George Bell and Sons. In comparison we have used also, (1956). *Kritik der reinen Vernunft*. Hamburg: Felix Meiner Verlag.

- Keller, Hermann (1964). „Die Chaconne g-Moll von- Vitali?“. *Neue Zeitschrift für Musik*, vol. 125. Leipzig: B. Schott's Söhne. 147–148.
- Kopytova, Galina; Heifetz, Albina-Starkova (2004). “First Performances in St. Petersburg”. *Jascha Heifetz. Early Years in Russia*. Translated by Dario Sarlo and Alexandra Sarlo. Indianapolis & Bloomington: Indiana University Press. 70–82.
- Lippman, Edward A. (1993). Chapter “A Humanistic Philosophy of Music”. Ruth Katz, Carl Dahlhaus (eds.) *Contemplating Music: Source Readings in the Aesthetics of Music*, vol. 4 *Community of Discourse*, folia Aesthetics of Music no. 5. New York: Pendragon Press Stuyvesant. 184–214.
- Lockwood, Lewis (2004). “2. “On the Beautiful in Music”: Beethoven’s Spring Sonata for Violin and Piano, Opus 24” Lewis Lockwood and Mark Kroll (eds.) *The Beethoven Violin Sonatas: History, Criticism, Performance*. Illinois, Chicago: University of Illinois Press, Urbana Chicago. 24 – 47.
- Sarlo, Dario (2015). *Performance Style of Jascha Heifetz*. First published 2015, secondly published 2016. London: Farnham, printed by Henry Ling Limited, Ashgate, Dorsett Press.
- *** (2008). “The Chaconne (Ciaconna) in D minor”, in Sonatas and partitas for solo violin, in The Wikipedians (eds.), *Johann Sebastian Bach: The Complete Guide*. 420–426.
- Thomson, Virgil (2014). In Page, Tim (ed.), *Music Chronicles 1940-1954. Musical Scene. The Art of Judging Music. Music Right and Left. Music Reviewed. Other Writings*. New York: Literary Classics of the United States.
- Vedran, Grahovac (2017). *The Promise of Circularity in Husserl’s Phenomenological Investigations*. PhD thesis. Ontario: University of Guelph.
https://atrium.lib.uoguelph.ca/xmlui/bitstream/handle/10214/12174/Grahovac_Vedran_201801_PhD.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y
- Vitali, Tomaso Antonio (1985). *Chaconne in G minor for Violin and Piano*. USA: Kalmus Classic Edition, K04388, Alfred Publishing. 24 pages.
- Waggener, Joshua A. (2016). “9. C.P.E. Bach’s *Heilig* and the ‘Holy’ of Rudolf Otto: An Eighteenth-Century Experience of the *Mysterium Tremendum*”. *Music and Transcendence*. Ed. Férdia J.Stone-Davis. London and New York: Routledge Taylor&Francis Group. 113 - 125.
- Walden, Joshua S. (2014). “1. 2. The Rural Miniature in Performance and Sound Recording”. *Sounding Authentic: The Rural Miniature and Musical Modernism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Zuckerkrandl, Victor (1992). Chapter “Sound and Symbol”. Ruth Katz, Carl Dahlhaus (eds.) *Contemplating Music: Source Readings in the Aesthetics of Music*, Vol. III *Essence*, Aesthetics in Music no. 5. New York: Pendragon Press Stuyvesant. 663–756.

Musical periodics:

- Bach, Johann Sebastian (2006). “Partita no. 2 in D minor”, written between 1717-1720, in Lawrence Golan edition, *Three Sonatas and Three Partitas for Solo Violin*, BWV 1001-1006. USA: Mel Bay Publication Pacific 2006. 70–72.
- Bach, Johann Sebastian (1720). *Adagio and Fugue for solo Violin in G minor*. BWV 1001, in *From 6 Sonatas in Violin Solo*, in Hans Wessely (ed.), (London: Joseph Williams, 1923).
- Gluck, Christoph Willibard (2008). *Orfeo ed Euridice*, wq. 30. First performed in Viena 5th October 1762, re-performed in Paris, 1774. Partiture by Performer's Reprints.
- ***“Guarnieri Exhibition Report”, *The Strad*, vol. 106, nr. 1260, pp. 375–379. DOI: <https://openmusiclibrary.org/article/768503/>.
- *** ‘Focus on Tononi 1736 Violin’, *The Strad*, vol 106, nr. 1257, pp. 50–51. DOI: <https://openmusiclibrary.org/article/768455/>.
- Vitali, Tomaso Antonio (1745 or before). *Chaconne in G minor*.
- Vitali, Tomaso Antonio (1712-1713). *L'Estro Armonico/ Libro secondo* (6 concertos). Edited by Roger Marchand d'Estienne. Amsterdam: Libraire de Michel Charles Le Cene.
- Schleske, Martin (2019). *Meisteratelier für Geigenbau*. Landsberg am Lech. <http://www.schleske.de/>, accessed March 18, 2019.

Arrangements and transcriptions of Chaconne in G minor:

- Charlier, Léopold (ca. 1911). *Tomaso Vitali Chaconne in G Mall*. Brüssels für Violine mit Bezzifertem bass nach der Ausgabe von Ferd. David Bearbeitet von Léopold Charlier für Violine mit Klavierbegleitung. Brüssels und Leipzig: Breitkopf und Härtel.
- David, Ferdinand (ca. 1900). *Chaconne*, In Emil Kross (ed.) Mainz: B. Schott's Sohne.
- Hermann, Friedrich (1899). *Ciaconna für Violine mit bezzifertem Bass*. Leipzig: Breitkopf und Härtel.

Exhibitions on the investigated theme:

- *** *Vioara Guarnieri la Palat. Expoziția viorile lui George Enescu* [The Guarnieri Violin on the Palace. The Violins of George Enescu Exhibition]. Museographer Sibianu, Adriana; scientific researcher, Cosma, Viorel. Bucharest: National Museum “George Enescu”. 26th March, 2019.